# DEVELOPING COLLABORATIVE LEARNING MODEL BETWEEN ENTREPRENEURSHIP PROGRAM AND BUSINESS INCUBATOR: AN INVESTIGATION FROM BUSINESS SCHOOLS IN INDONESIA

**[1]NILA KRISNAWATI, [2]ALFIANDRI, [3]KHO I ENG**

Faculty of Business Administration and Humanities, Faculty of IT and Engineering
Swiss German University, Indonesia

**Abstract:** This study aims to examine the current implementation of entrepreneurship learning including business incubator and to identify factors influencing the effectiveness of entrepreneurship and incubator output including developing collaborative learning model in each particular faculties/universities in Jakarta and Tangerang.
This study conducted the qualitative analysis used Focus Group Discussion (FGD) and in -depth interview approaches to 8 (eight) universities and 15 academicians with strong background in managing as well as entrepreneurship teaching experiences.
The study brings the result that the strong collaboration between the study programs and business incubator must be strongly established to provide entrepreneurship learning experiences in higher education. There are significant aspects as an influencing factors to create collaborative model between entrepreneurship program and business incubator; university's vision and mission, entrepreneurial background lecturer, strong culture and reward system.
This study is claimed as few studies focusing on developing a collaborative model specifically to the universities which have business incubator in Indonesia.Studies on the effect on collaborative learning model on entrepreneurship toward succesful entrepreneurship education would be considerably fill in the gaps in thebody of knowledge on the subject.

**Keywords:** entrepreneurship, business incubator, collaborative learning model.

## I. INTRODUCTION

(Etzkowitz, 2000) stated that the two main activities delivered by the traditional university are teaching and research. However, there was a new approach to the role of universities visualizes a structural shift from their traditional to the commercialization of new knowledge for economic development. Most universities have been paying attention on the creating and implementing these new approaches becoming entrepreneurs universities.

They do belief that entrepreneurship program is dynamic andflexible to strengthens students' life pathways, including personal growth, social participation and the value sharing development.Through the entrepreneurship program and activities, universities gain the benefit to foster entrepreneurial spirit and skills including encouraging young generations to establish their start up business. Storen (2014) have founded through her research in Norway that graduates who have had entrepreneurship education are not more frequently self-employed than other graduates.

Therefore, education should increase entrepreneurship awareness from primary school to university (Rybnicek*et al*., 2015).Introducing young people to entrepreneurship triggers their initiative and helps them to be more creative and self-confident (European Commission, 2006). The significance of entrepreneurship education has been growing ever since the first entrepreneurship class was held in 1947 in the USA, and especially from the 1980s on, when Drucker's Innovation and Entrepreneurship was published (Drucker, 1985; Katz, 2003).
In another hand, the existance of business incubator is an important tool that can be used by universities to support new start-ups and spin-offs, as well as to build links with industry (EC/OECD, 2012). It becomes the obligation of business incubators to nurture the creation and development of the new, innovative, sustainable companies by providing prospective business conditions (Bikse, Veronika *et al*., 2016). These findings shows the critical role of business incubator for the higher eduction in achieving the succesful of entrepreneurship program.
From the description above, the critical problem founded is determining the methods that should be designed to teach entrepreneurship.

In many universities, entrepreneurship is commonly taught as one of the subjects, more over, it is even still taught as an elective subject. In the business school, entrepreneurship has grown to become one of the majors. But at the university level, only few universities have adopted entrepreneurship courses that involve students from various departments, whereas entrepreneurship so far is best taught by using multidisciplinary approach and engage with their business incubator. The study method still remains unimproved, since the collaborative learning model is still not available yet.

The objective of this paper is two fold. Firstly, we examine the current implementation of entrepreneurship learning including business incubator in particular universities. The second objective is to develop the collaborative learning

model of entrepreneurship between its current curriculum and existing incubator in particular faculties/universities.

## II. ENTREPRENEURSHIP EDUCATION IN INDONESIA

Research's result from Wiratno (2012), that the execution of entrepreneurship in higher education in Indonesia has not been delivered well including the limitation of the infrastructure required for this program. There are currently more than 2900 higher education institutions in Indonesia and each year these institutions produce more than 1 million graduates all over the country (Ardianti, 2009).Many universities in Indonesia have been implementing the entrepreneurship as a part of their mandatory subjects. However, there were still limited for those who have been develop a collaborative learning model between itscurrent curriculums with their existing incubator. The effect of their program in shapingthe spirit and skill of entrepreneurship haven't been measured either, by determining the significant indicators.

Business incubator is another supporting factor for the university to succeed the entrepreneurship program. The vision to become a center of excellence for the entrepreneurship were suspected partially delivered without collaborating with the current curriculum from the universities. The tenants who became their target were not focusing to the current students yet, since there were many constraints facing by involving the student for this program. Therefore, it is necessary to conduct the study for developing a collaborative learning model between current curriculums with its incubator in the universities. The result will bring valuable benefits to run effective program both in the perspective of university as well as their incubator.

Based on Directorate General of Higher Education in Indonesia, called DIKTI, the budget allocation to support entrepreneurship program in 2009 through grants delivery was around 37 billions rupiahs (Adrianti, 2009). The government uses this fund for students entrepreneurship program. There were consisting of some private universities, polytechnics and state universities such GadjahMada University, Bandung Technology Institute, Indonesia University, Airlangga University, Bogor Agriculture Institute, and Diponegoro University.At the university level, only few universities has adopted entrepreneurship courses involving students from various departments, whereas entrepreneurship so far is best taught by using multidisciplinary approach. All of these show that entrepreneurship education in higher education in Indonesia is still at the early stage.This early stage should be continued with a more integrative long term program to gain desired results. Indonesia needs to build a national plan in entrepreneurship education involving students from elementary schools into universities. Many previous researches have explained on the conceptual model of entrepreneurship in education and found the fact that there were confusion in conceiving entrepreneurship and the methods used to teach it. However, there were no shared understandings to conceptualize the model as an integration of two domains: entrepreneurship and education. Poloniemi (2012) stated that in universities, entrepreneurship education teachers tend to either adopt the discovery theory or follow their own instincts originating from their everyday observations of how entrepreneurs seem to manage their businesses.As a result, EE teachers typically concentrate on how to run a business rather than how to create new business opportunities or how to createa new business.

## III. CASE STUDY INVESTIGATION

In this section the researchers analyzed the implementation of entrepreneurship program at the investigated universities by conducted the indepth interview and focus group discussionto 8 (eight) universities and 15 academicians with strong background in managing as well as teaching experiences. The process have conducted only to the universities which have business incubator - state and private universities - in Jakarta and Tangerangheld on 24 February 2017 at Ibis Gading Tangerang. There are few universities in Jakarta and Tangerang have business incubator with the estimation less then 5 universities. Therefore the sample size was already reach sixty percent from the population. The question focused on: (1) the current program of entrepreneurship integrated with its business incubator, (2) the factor influencing effectiveness of entrepreneurship program and business incubator, (3) the collaborative learning model between entrepreneurship program and business incubator. The reserachers used Focus Group Discussion (FGD) which Wilkinson, (2004, p. 177) explained that focus group research is "a way of collecting qualitative data, which—essentially— involves engaging a small number of people in an informal group discussion (or discussions), 'focused' around a particular topic or set of issues" Focus group discussion also considered less threatening to many research participants, and this setting is useful for participants to discuss perceptions, ideas, opinions, and thoughts (Krueger & Casey, 2000).

## IV. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION:

The profile of participants are mostly come from provate universities, however there was one from state university. 7 (seven) participants are lecturers (46.66%), 4 persons are deputy head of business (26.66%), 4 persons are the manager/director of incubator (26.66%).The content of indepth interview process are summarized as follow ;

**Tabel 1. How is the current program of entrepreneurship integrated with its business incubator.**

| No | Description | Parti-cipant code |
|---|---|---|
| 1 | The universty have decided to embedded the entrepreneurship activities into curricullum integrated with business incubaator. The credits are more than 4 credits. Student must provide the project in group and it can be considered as an option for a thesis before they graduate from studying. | KH |
| 2 | It was delivered as one of subject curricullum for particular semester, however it was not mandatory for joining business incubator. The credits of this subject are less than 4 credits. Only those have interested will join the business incubator program. | NS |
| 3 | We did not set the entrepreneurship subject into one of incubator business program. However we provide significant activities for those who will join the program and at the end it can be weaved as the score for the entrepreneurship subject with particular terms and condition. The credits for entrepreneurship subject is 3 credits (management) and 2 credits (non management) | YS, BM,HR, IR |
| 4 | On the digital marketing consentration the total credits up to 24 credits. Each study program is different. The students must present their project in front of the venture, but is not integrated yet with the incubator. | RR, SK |
| 5 | The entrepreneurship subject has 7 credits and disentralized through each study program. It is not integrated with business incubator yet, since we faced challenges in term of participants' culture who are majorely employeed students. | IG, MH |
| 6 | With 3 credits under each study program, the entrepreneurship subject has been setting based on two models : lecturing and project. However it doesn't integrated yet with incubator business. | HD,RN, IM |
| 7 | The subject is 2 credits and delivered at semester 5 and 6, assessed through written and project. However we haven't set the subject into incubator, but more to tracing the the student after they graduate from university. | MK |
| 8 | We have 8 credits spread at some semesters. At the end they have to prepare the project through subject entrepreneur venture at semester 5. The subject does not integrated yet, however those with excellent performances are recommended to continue to the business incubator. | MR |

**Tabel 2.What are the factors influencing effectiveness of entrepreneurship program and business incubator**

| No | Description | Participants Code |
|---|---|---|
| 1 | The university support and lecturer are necessary for implementing the succesful entrepreneurship and incubator program and activities. | KH |
| 2 | The mechanism/system will bring the lecturer and students easy to accomplish each goal and objective of entrepreneurship and incubator program. | NS |
| 3 | We have to create "the bridge" to understand and increase the passion and awereness of the students about the entrepreneurship and business incubator's role. And also great lecturer who could motivate them to think out of the box. | YS, BM,HR, IR |
| 4 | Lecturers ar every important to make the succesful of entrepreneurship program. Beside that, environtment could shape the mindset of the students too. | RR, SK |
| 5 | Having a project with inspiring lecturers are very critical for the successful learning and entrepreneurship program and activities | IG, MH |
| 6 | Background and culture of the participants (students) are the iinfluencing factors of an effective business incubator program | HD,RN, IM |
| 7 | The students need to have a real role model. | MK |
| 8 | It is really necessary to set up great curriculum to attract the students and support from all related departments. | MR |

**Tabel 3. How to create the collaborative learning model between entrepreneurship program and business incubator?**

| No | Description | Partici-pants Code |
|---|---|---|
| 1 | The university support is critical to succeed the effective learning of entrepreneurship. The lecturers will comply with the university's policy to run any single program including for entrepreneurship and incubator. | KH |
| 2 | The university play a vital role to create effective mechanism for the succesful model. It is very hard for thelecture and incubator staff to run the program without it. | NS |
| 3 | The incubator must have a strong and clear concept to enggange with university's mission and vision. It will stimulate both parties to create many program that stimulate the students' passion and reward them for every effort they have shown. | YS, BM,HR IR |
| 4 | Effective mentoring could be delivered to create effective learning between the students and lecturer. Therefore the result could be proceed further in incubator. | RR, SK |
| 5 | The model could be developed only if the lecturers are potential with the strong background in entrepreneurship. It must be supported too by the university. | IG, MH |
| 6 | The university must established curriculum which connected with the incubator | HD,RN, IM |
| 7 | It must be started by the vision and mission from the university level before. | MK |
| 8 | Reward system for the students who have a great project and involvement at their business plan/project, supported by the management. | MR |

## V. COLLABORATIVE LEARNING MODEL BETWEEN ENTREPRENEURSHIP PROGRAM AND BUSINESS INCUBATOR

Based on the FGD result above, the collaborative model between entrepreneurship program and business incubator must consider following critical aspects ; the university's vision and mission, lecturer commitment, strong culture and reward system.




**Figure 1. Collaborative Learning Model Between Entrepreneurship Program and Business Incubator**
**Source: Field working, 2017**

## VI. IMPLICATION AND RECOMMENDATION

The literature shown most universities shown a great effort to implement the entrepreneurship programs and activities. However there are still a few of them synergize the program through their business incubator. Similar with in Indonesia, there are many approaches have been done to deliver the entrepreneurship learning. However, most of them are still depend on the tradtional approaches ; they more focus on how to run the business in limited credits system. The lecturers and culture of entrepreneurs are considered become the most challenging factors in observed universities.

The finding of this studies that university's role is very significant factor to influence effective learning of entrepreneurship and business incubator. There must be a strong and clear vision on this aspect for further mechanism and achievement. Lectures, reward system and culture are also critical aspects to create a collaborative learning model between entrepreneurship and business incubator in the higher education. Studies on the effect on collaborative learning model on entrepreneurship toward succesful entrepreneurship education would be considerably fill in the gaps in th ebody of knowledge on the subject.

## REFERENCES

[1] Ardianti, Retno (2009) Entrepreneurship Education in Indonesia's Higher Education Institutions: A Solution for Problems Faced by The Next Generation. London International Conference on Education (LICE), UK.

[2] Bikse, Veronika and IneseLusena-Ezera, BaibaRivza, TatjanaVolkova (2016) ;The Transformation of Traditional Universities into Entrepreneurial Universities to Ensure Sustainable Higher Education ; Journal of Teacher Education for Sustainability, vol. 18, no. 2, pp. 75- 88, 2016 , DOI: 10.1515/jtes-2016-0016

[3] Binks, M., Starkey, K., & Mahon, C.L., (2006) :Entrepreneurship Education and the Business School, Technology Analysis & Strategic Management Vol. 18, No. 1.

[4] Drucker, P. F. (1985). Innovation and entrepreneurship: Practice and principles (1st Perennial Library ed). New York: Perennial Library.

[5] Etzkowitz H., Webster A., Gebhardt C., Brance R., &Cantisano T. (2000). The future of the University and the University of the future: Evolution of ivory tower to entrepreneurial paradigm. Research Policy, 29(2), 313-330.

[6] EC/OECD. (2012). A Guiding Framework for Entrepreneurial Universities.Final version 18 December 2012. Retrieved December 3, 2015, from http://www.oecd.org/site/ cfecpr/EC-OECD%20Entrepreneurial%20Universities%20Framework.pdf

[7] Hadjimanolis, A., (2007) ;Entrepreneurship Education in Cyprus: From Humble Beginnings to a Promising Future? Journal of Business and Society

[8] Katz, J. A. (2003). The chronology and intellectual trajectory of American entrepreneurship education. Journal of Business Venturing, 18(2), 283–300. doi:10.1016/S0883-9026(02)00098-8

[9] Kuratko D. F., T(2005), The Emergence of Entrepreneurship Education:Development, Trends, and Challenges.Entrepreneurship Theory and Practices.

[10] Krueger, R. A., & Casey, M. A. (2000). Focus groups: A practical guide for applied researchers (3rd ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

[11] Storen, Liv-Anne (2014), Entrepreneurship in higher education; Impacts on graduates' entrepreneurial intentions, activity and learning outcome, Journal of Education Training, Vol.56 No.8/9, pp 795-813.

[12] Paloniemi, Kaarlo, Belt, Pekka(2012), Mismatch in Teachers' Ontological Conception of Entrepreneurship Education, Journal of Entrepreneurs Vo.11. No.2

[13] Rybnicek, Robert ;Ruhri, Matthias; Suk, Katharina (2015), How To Integrate Entrepreneurship Education And Creativity Into A Bureaucratic Environment (Case Study) ; 9th International Scientific Conference "Economic and Social Development" , Istanbul, 9-10 April 2015.

[14] Wilkinson, S. (2004). Focus group research. In D. Silverman (ed.), Qualitative research: Theory, method, and practice (pp. 177–199). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

★★★