COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS ON HEALTH LAWS AND REGULATIONS FOR MEDICAL TOURISM IN ASIAN COUNTRIES

[1]UDVAL NATSAG, [2]OUYNTSETSEG DASH, [3]JARGALKHAND BUDKHAND, [4]DELGERMAA BAYARSUREN

[1]Professor, ScD in Healthcare Management, PhD in Medicine, Global Leadership University, Mongolia
[2]Ph.D in Medicine, Global Leadership University, Mongolia
[3]Fellow in Law, Global Leadership University, Mongolia
[4]Epidemiologist, Master Student at Global Leadership University, Mongolia
E-mail: udval@glu.edu.mn

Abstract - Medicaltourism, as a trending phenomenon and medical industry, is a challenging and pressing agenda of any health system worldwide. With uncertain regulation mechanisms and a lack of quality assurance of service outcomes, it is important to undertake a comparative analysis to clarify and revise current laws and regulation mechanisms for medical tourism at national, regional, and global levels.

The aims of the study are to compare laws and regulations for medical tourism in Asian countries, including those in the Northeast Asian, Southeast Asian, and Central Asian regions. The study is qualitative, descriptive, and comparative, using data from literature reviews, other open-access research papers, and study reports.Comparable variables of the study are dominant services, the laws and regulations, problems, future trends and scenarios for medical tourism, and best practices and weaknesses.

The study found that the dominant services for medical tourism in Asian countries are different depending on the countries.The laws and regulations for medical tourism in most countries address issues of accreditation of healthcare institutions, visa policies, and malpractice regulations. Inconsistency of legal environment and health service quality is main problem of medical tourism in all countries.

Asian countries seem to be strengthened and more efficiently regulated in the future, have the best practices in health laws and regulations for medical tourism to share with other countries, but there are common weaknesses.
In conclusion, medical tourism has certain stages of development, namely growing, emerging, and founding of medical tourism, depending on market positioning and experiences. The stages of development of medical tourism could be determined dominant services, laws and regulations, problems and issues, future trends and scenarios, and best practices and weaknesses

Keywords - Medical tourism, Dominant Services, Laws and Regulations

I. INTRODUCTION

Medical tourism is the travel of people from their home countries to destination countries to get medical care. Ordinarily, it was considered traveling people from less developed countries to developed countries to obtain high-quality medical care, but nowadays, traveling people from developed countries to developing countries for lower-priced medical treatments has become popular. Some authors argue that the reason for traveling people from developing countries to developed countries to get medical treatment is the unavailability of services at home (1.2). Others emphasize that most often services for medical tourism are surgeries, dental care, and fertility-related services (3)

Study findings suggest that the main factors for medical tourism are the high cost of health care, long waiting times for some diagnostic and treatment procedures, the need for high technology, and standards of care (4.5).Although medical tourism is attractive, profitable, and a growing medical industry, it has legal, social, and ethical implications that require a proper legal environment and regulations. Legal implications arise from unfamiliar legal issues and illegal services (6), while ethical issues may arise from the cases of illegal organ trade and tissues for transplantation and inequalities of care (7.8.9.10.11.12.13.14)

Cornell J was considered that “Medical tourism is a phenomenon in the private health-care market, which makes it hard to monitor and regulate patient flows” (15), Other studies found that there is an increase in the number of papers presenting findings from primary research in medical travel (16). Findings of a systematic review of publications studies indicate the definition of medical tourism in various articles, and medical tourists are motivated. However, most studies indicate the benefits of medical tourism in developing countries and more developed countries reflect the consequences of medical tourism (17). Many countries such as Thailand, Singapore, Hungary, Argentina, Malaysia, Cuba, Israel, Brazil, Jordan, Turkey, and India and others consider medical tourism promotes sustainable development and economic dynamics (18, 19, 20,21)

Systematic review of qualitative evidence (22) criticizes that medical tourism has become a rapidly growing market due to rising disparities in health care costs, of those especially with advanced health care facilities,and stressthe importance of dimensions, and drivers of medical tourism industry, in contrast, other scoping reviews (23) addresses the effects of medical tourism in destination and departure countries and suggest that five interrelated themes are (i) user of public resources; (ii) solution of health system problems; (iii) revenue generating industry; (iv) standard of care; and (v) source of inequity.

However, there are still gaps in evidence, knowledge, theoretical and practical domains of health laws and regulations for medical tourism that need more comparative research in dominant services, health laws and regulations for medical tourism.

Aims of the study

The study aims to examine health laws and regulations for medical tourism in Asian countries

Objectives of the study

1. Study dominant medical services for medical tourism and health laws and regulations in Asian countries;
2. Study problems and issues for medical tourism in Asian countries;
3. Examine future trends and scenarios for medical tourism in Asian countries; and
4. Identify the best practices and weaknesses of medical tourism in Asian countries

Data and Methodologies

This study is a qualitative, descriptive, and comparative study on health laws and regulations for medical tourism in Asian countries that include the countries of the Northeast, Southeast, and Central Asian regions. Google Scholar, PubMed, Research Gate, and other open research journals were used for searching and extracting data.

Research questions were what kind of medical services are provided, under what health laws and regulations, what problems and challenges have been facing, what will be future trends and possible scenarios for medical tourism, and what are the best practices and weaknesses in medical tourism in Asian countries.

The method of content analysis was used for the study to interpret, summarize research findings, and evaluate/conclude the study.

Study results

(i) Study results of dominant medical services, health laws and regulations for medical tourism in Asian countries are as follows:

1.Northeast Asian countries

1.1. Dominant medical servicesfor medical tourism in Northeast Asian countries arecosmetic surgery, cancer treatment, regenerative medicine, stem cell therapy, plastic surgery, and IVF.

1.2. Health Laws and Regulationsin Northeast Asian countries for medical tourism are medical services acts and visa policies in all countries, Medical Tourism promotion act and Regulation on brokers and Malpractice and Liability in South Korea, Regenerative Medicine Act and Language and Informed Consent in Japan, Regulations in Human Genetic Resources in China, Law in Accreditation of Medical Institutions in Mongolia and Russia, and Regulation of Experimental and High-Risk Treatments and Medical Liability & Insurance Laws in Russia.

II. SOUTHEAST ASIAN COUNTRIES

2.1. Dominant medical services for medical tourism in Southeast Asian countries are cosmetic surgery and dental procedures are in all countries,cardiac, orthopedic surgeries &joint replacements, oncology services, and IVF services are common in India, Thailand, and Malaysia,organ transplantation and neurosurgery in India, advanced cancer therapies, robotic surgeries, and organ transplants in Singapore, stem cell therapy and executive check-ups in The Philippines

2.2. Health Laws and Regulations in Southeast Asian countries for medical tourism are Hospital Accreditation, Visa and Immigration Regulations, Medical Malpractice and Liability, Insurance and Billing Regulations are common in all countries, Healthcare Regulations and Standards, Patient Rights and Consumer Protection, Medical Malpractice and Liability, Data Privacy and Confidentiality Regulations in India.

III. CENTRAL ASIAN COUNTRIES

3.1. Dominant medical services for medical tourism in Central Asian countries are oncology, cardiology, and organ transplantation services in Kazakhstan, dental care in Uzbekistan and Kyrgyzstan, traditional medicine in Tajikistan, Uzbekistan, and Kyrgyzstan

3.2. Health Laws and Regulations for medical tourism in Central Asian countries are Medical care and Public health laws, and Medical accreditation system regulations in all countries, and there is no medical visa in these countries.

Study results in dominant medical services, health laws and regulation show that cosmetic surgeries and dental services are more dominantservices in Asian

countries, regenerative medical services, stem cell therapy, cancer treatment, plastic surgery, and IVF services are provided by the most countries of the Northeast Asian Region, but organ transplantation, orthopedic surgeries, advanced cancer therapies, robotic surgeries aredominant services in Southeast Asian countries, in contrast, the countries in central Asian region provide services in oncology, cardiology, and organ transplantation. Health laws and regulations for medical tourism in Asian countries have similarities and differences. The similarities in health laws and regulations for medical tourism are medical/healthcare acts, visa policies, accreditation, and malpractice regulations. The countries are different from each other in medical tourism promotion acts, regulations on brokers, human genetic resources, patient rights, and consumer protection.

(ii) Study results of problems and issues in health laws and regulations for medical tourism in Asian countries are as follows:

1.Northeast Asian countries

1.1. Problems in health laws and regulations for medical tourism in Northeast Asian countries are language barriers, quality and consistency of health services, medical visa and legal issues, cost of treatment and hidden fees, cultural differences, lack of international accreditation, accessibility and infrastructure

1.2. Issues in health laws and regulations for medical tourism in Northeast Asian countries are limited english proficiency, lack of multilingual services, lack of standardization, limited experience with international patients, complicated visa processes, legal and regulatory uncertainties, unclear pricing structure, additional costs for international patients, differences in patient-doctor communication, cultural sensitivity, limited inconsistent regulatory oversight and accreditation, geographical barriers, and limited transportation options.

2. Southeast Asian countries

2.1.Problems in health laws and regulations for medical tourism in Southeast Asian countries are visa and immigration, quality control and standardization, medical negligence and malpractice, ethical and legal, insurance and payment, and inconsistent enforcement of laws are common in all countries, language barriers in Thailand, Vietnam, and the Philippines, tourism impact in Thailand, lack of medical tourism infrastructure in Vietnam, high costs, limited availability of affordable care, and limited international insurance coverage in Singapore

2.2. Issues in health laws and regulations for medical tourism in Southeast Asian countries are complicated visa processes, lack of standardization, legal and regulatory uncertainties, unclear pricing structure, additional costs for international patients, limited English proficiency, lack of multilingual services, excessive burden on medical doctors for foreign patients, and limited affordability of services

3. Central Asian countries

3.1. Problems in health laws and regulations for medical tourism in Central Asian countries are quality of healthcare, language barriers, visa requirements, lack of international patient services, insurance limitations are common problems in all countries, limited medical infrastructure and lack of medical tourism services in some countries

3.2. Issues in health laws and regulations for medical tourism in Central Asian countries are limited English proficiency, lack of multilingual services, lack of standardization, limited experience with international patients, complicated visa processes, and legal and regulatory uncertainties.

Study results in problems and issues in health laws and regulations for medical tourism show that Northeast Asian countries face the problems of quality and consistency of healthcare services, medical visa and legal issues, cost of treatment and hidden fees, cultural differences, lack of international accreditation, accessibility and infrastructure. Southeast Asian countries face the problems of visa and immigration, quality control and standardization, medical negligence and malpractice, ethical and legal issues, insurance and payment, and Inconsistent enforcement of laws. Problems of health laws and regulations for medical tourism in Central Asian countries are quality of health care, language issues, visa, lack of international patient services, and insurance issues.

(iii) Study results in future trends and scenarios for medical tourism in Asian countries are as follows:

1.Northeast Asian countries

1.1. Future trends for medical tourism in Northeast Asian countries are development of unified regulatory frameworks, increasing collaboration and development of standardized medical tourism regulations across the region, expansion of accreditation systems and quality standards, adoption of international accreditation standards to enhance the quality of healthcare and patient safety, integration of technology and telemedicine in medical tourism, increasing use of telemedicine and digital healthcare services in the medical tourism sector, strengthening Patient Protection Laws.

The countries in the region may implement more robust patient protection and legal frameworks for medical tourists. increased focus on medical tourism marketing and branding, more focus on branding and promoting medical tourism as a specialized sector in Northeast Asia and improved tourism infrastructure for medical tourists

1.2. Scenarios for medical tourism are South Korea and Japan may begin collaborating to create a more unified regulatory framework for medical tourism. Countries will likely strengthen their accreditation systems. expand the use of digital health platforms. South Korea and Japan are expected to develop comprehensive patient protection laws for international patients, Countries will likely engage in more targeted marketing campaigns to position themselves as top medical tourism destinations. Medicaltourists in Northeast Asia are rising, and governments and private enterprises may increase investment in infrastructures.

2. Southeast Asian countries

2.1. Future trends for medical tourism in Southeast Asian countries are development of Unified Medical Tourism Regulations, growth in medical tourism niches, increased focus on patient protection and rights, rise of public-private partnerships (PPPs), use of big data and Artificial Intelligence (AI) for medical tourism optimization

2.2. Scenarios for medical tourism in Southeast Asian countries are collaborate on creating standardized regulations to ensure consistent quality of care, patient safety, and provider qualifications, integrate telemedicine into the medical tourism experience, adopt stricter patient protection laws, addressing issues like medical malpractice, insurance coverage, and informed consent, and governments and private healthcare providers will collaborate more through PPPs to enhance the healthcare infrastructure needed for medical tourism.

3. Central Asian countries

3.1. Future trends for medical tourism in Central Asian countries are development of comprehensive medical tourism regulations, integration of medical tourism with tourism and hospitality, adoption of international healthcare accreditation, utilization of digital health and telemedicine, rise of traditional medicine integration and strengthening public-private partnerships

3.2. Scenarios for medical tourism in Central Asian countries are countries will likely introduce clear, standardized regulations governing medical tourism, align their medical tourism offerings with broader tourism infrastructure, countries like Kazakhstan, may see an increase in healthcare facilities seeking JCI (Joint Commission International) or ISO certification, incorporate telemedicine into their medical tourism services, Kyrgyzstan and Tajikistan may increasingly promote their traditional healing practices as part of a broader medical tourism offering.

Future trends and scenarios of health laws and regulations for medical tourism in Asian countries seem to be strengthened and more efficiently regulated in the future, aiming to develop unified regulatory frameworks, increase collaboration, revise accreditation systems and quality standards, integrate technology and telemedicine, digital health services in medical tourism, increased focus on patient protection, use of Big data and Artificial Intelligence for medical tourism, and develop Public-Private partnerships.

(iv) Best practices in medical tourism in Asian countries are as follows:

1.Northeast Asian countries

1.1. Best practices in medical tourism in Northeast Asian countries are well-defined regulatory frameworks in South Korea, integration of telemedicine in Japan, strong international patient centers in China

1.2. Key elements of best practices in Northeast Asian countries are accreditation and certification, language support, insurance coverage, telemedicine services allow patients to have remote consultations with Japanese healthcare providers, comprehensive patient rights, foreign patient visa facilitation, and comprehensive care

2. Southeast Asian countries

2.1. Best practices in medical tourism in Southeast Asian countries are well-established certification and accreditation systems in Thailand, Government-driven medical tourism initiatives in Malaysia, strong legal and regulatory frameworks in Singapore and medical tourism legislation and support in Indonesia

2.2. Key elements of best practices in Southeast Asian countries are comprehensive accreditation, medical tourism facilitation, specialized medical centers, medical tourism act, Malaysia's medical, international certification, integrated health and tourism sectors,regulation by the Singapore Medical Council, international accreditation, transparent pricing and billing, development of medical tourism zones, partnership with private sector and accreditation and standards.

3. Central Asian countries

3.1. Best practices in medical tourismin Central Asian countries are development of international patient services in Kazakhstan, investment in health tourism infrastructure in Uzbekistan, and promotion of traditional medicine in Kyrgyzstan

3.2. Key elements of best practicesin Central Asian countries are dedicated medical tourism centers, collaborations with international health organizations, visa facilitation, spa and wellness centers, Government incentives, traditional healing centers, and regulatory support for traditional practices

Asian countries have the best practices in health laws and regulations for medical tourism, such as well-defined regulatory frameworks in South Korea,

integration of telemedicine in Japan, and strong international patient centers in China in the Northeast Asian region. Well-established certification and accreditation systems in Thailand, government-driven medical tourism initiatives in Malaysia, strong legal and regulatory frameworks in Singapore, and medical tourism legislation and support in Indonesia in Southeast Asian countries. Development of international patient services in Kazakhstan, investment in health tourism infrastructure in Uzbekistan, promotion of traditional medicine in Kyrgyzstanare best practices in Central Asian countries.

(v) Weaknesses and challenges for medical tourism in Asian countries are as follows:

1.Northeast Asian countries

1.1. Weaknesses of medical tourism in Northeast Asian countries are Inconsistent standards and regulation enforcement in China, limited patient protection laws in Japan, and high costs and limited affordability in South Korea

1.2. Challenges for medical tourism in Northeast Asian countries are lack of uniform standards, regulatory gaps, limited legal recourse on patient safety standards, high medical costs, and insurance challenges

2. Southeast Asian countries

1.1. Weaknesses of medical tourism in Southeast Asian countries are inconsistent quality assurance in certain countries, regulatory gaps in smaller markets, language and cultural barriers in less developed countries, patient protection and legal recource, and ethical concerns and unregulated alternative medicine

1.2. Challenges for medical tourism in Southeast Asian countries are lack of international accreditation, regional disparities, absence of legal frameworks, limited government oversight, ;ack of English-speaking medical staff, cultural sensitivities, limited legal recourse, enforcement of patient rights, lack of regulation for alternative treatments, and misleading marketing.

3. Central Asian countries

1.1. Weaknesses of medical tourismin Central Asian countries are Fragmented and Inconsistent Regulatory Frameworks, Lack of International Accreditation and Quality Assurance, Limited Infrastructure and Access to Healthcare Services, Lack of Strong Patient Protection Laws, and Economic and Political Instability

1.2. Challenges for medical tourismin Central Asian countries are Unclear and lack of Guidelines on international patient care, medical malpractice laws, and patient rights, Inconsistent Quality of Care, Limited Monitoring of Medical Providers, Urban-Centered Medical Tourism,Insufficient Specialized Services, Limited Legal Frameworks, Weak Enforcement of Patient Rights, Unpredictable Economic Policies, and Limited Foreign Investment

The weaknesses in health laws and regulations for medical tourism in Asian countries. Common weaknesses for all countries are inconsistent regulatory mechanisms and quality assurance of medical services, ethical concerns, and high cost and low insurance coverage. There are country-specific weaknesses as shown in the table 5.

LIMITATIONS OF THE STUDY

The study has three limitations due to geographical coverage limited by Asian countries, context focusing on only legal and regulatory mechanisms for medical tourism, and selecting four aspects (dominant services, laws and regulations, problems and issues, trends and scenarios, and best practices and weaknesses of medical tourism). There could be more research questions related to the cost of dominant services in each country, quality, and outcomes of medical services, and theoretical and practical aspects of medical tourism

CONCLUSION

Medical tourism has been growing in Japan. South Korea, China, India, Singapore, and Thailand, emerging in Russia, Kazakhstan, Malaysia, the Philippines, Indonesia, Vietnam, founding in Mongolia, Uzbekistan, Kyrgyzstan, and Tajikistan. This classification of medical tourism in Asian countries reflects the development stages of medical tourism in these countries and results in the availability and effectiveness of health laws and regulations for medical tourism. Dominant services are cosmetic surgeries and dental services, region specific services are regenerative medical services, stem cell therapy, cancer treatment, plastic surgery, and IVF services are provided by the countries of the Northeast Asian Region, organ transplantation, orthopedic surgeries, advanced cancer therapies, robotic surgeries are region specific dominant services in Southeast Asian countries, the countries in central Asian region provide services in oncology, cardiology, and organ transplantation. Health laws and regulations for medical tourism in Asian countries have similarities and differences. The similarities in health laws and regulations for medical tourism are Medical/Healthcare acts, visa policies, accreditation, and malpractice regulations. The countries are different from each other in medical tourism promotion acts, regulations on brokers, human genetic resources, patient rights, and consumer protection. Asian countries face problems of quality and consistency of healthcare services, medical visas and legal isues, cost of treatment and hidden fees, cultural differences, lack of international accreditation, and accessibility and infrastructure. Asian countries seem to be strengthened and more

efficiently regulated in the future, have the best practices in health laws and regulations for medical tourism to share with other countries, but there are common weaknesses such us inconsistent regulatory mechanisms and quality assurance of medical services, ethical concerns, and high cost and insurance coverage.

REFERENCES

[1] Horowitz, Michael D.; Rosensweig, Jeffrey A.; Jones, Christopher A. (2007). "Medical Tourism: Globalization of the Healthcare Marketplace". MedGenMed. 9 (4): 33. PMC 2234298. PMID 18311383.

[2] "Medical tourism--health care in the global economy" (PDF). Physician Exec. Retrieved 16 September 2012.

[3] Paul McFedries (2006-05-17). "fertility tourism". Word Spy. Archived from the original on 2006-06-01. Retrieved 2011-10-29.

[4] Goering, Laurie (March 28, 2008). "For big surgery, Delhi is dealing". Chicago Tribune. Archived from the original on April 1, 2008.

[5] Tompkins, Olga (2010). "Medical Tourism". AAOHN Journal. 58 (1): 40. doi:10.3928/08910162-20091223-04. PMID 20102121. S2CID 44770932.

[6] 6. Bovier P. Medical tourism: A new kind of traveler? Rev Med Suisse. 2008;4:119698-201

[7] David Kilgour; David Matas (31 January 2007). "An Independent Investigation into Allegations of Organ Harvesting of Falun Gong Practitioners in China".

[8] "Debt drives kidney harvesting in Pakistan's citrus orchards". Reuters. 2017-09-11. Retrieved 2021-11-16.

[9] Lee Mendoza Roger (2010). "Colombia's organ trade: Evidence from Bogotá and Medellín". Journal of Public Health. 18 (4): 375–384. doi:10.1007/s10389-010-0320-3. S2CID 35056299.

[10] Roger Lee Mendoza (2010). "Price deflation and the underground organ economy in the Philippines". Oxford Journal of Public Health. 33 (1): 101–107. Archived from the original on 2011-03-24.

[11] "The Declaration of Istanbul on Organ Trafficking and Transplant Tourism". Kidney International. 74 (7): 854–59. 2008. doi:10.1038/ki.2008.388. PMC 2813140. PMID 20142924.

[12] "Indian Journal of Medical Ethics". Archived from the original on 30 July 2013. Retrieved 9 June 2015.

[13] "Medical Tourism Creates Thai Doctor Shortage". NPR.org. NPR. Retrieved 2011-10-29.

[14] Lindvall, O; Hyun, I (2011-10-03). "Medical innovation versus stem cell tourism". Science. 324 (5935): 1664–5. doi:10.1126/science.1171749. PMID 19556497. S2CID 27119258.

[15] Connell J. A new inequality? Privatisation, urban bias, migration and medical tourism. Asia Pac Viewp 2011;52:260–71. [PubMed] [Reference list]

[16] Chapter 3. Systematic review: what do we know about medical tourism? https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/books/NBK263164/

[17] Masoud, Ferdosi; Alireza, Jabbari; Mahmoud, Keyvanara1; Zahra, Agharahimi2, A systematic review of publications studies on medical tourism Journal of Education and Health Promotion 2(1):p 51, | DOI: 10.4103/2277-9531.119037

[18] Connell J. Medical tourism: Sea, sun, sand and surgery Tourism Manage. 2006;27:1093–100

[19] Caballero-Danell S, Mugomba C. Medical tourism and its entrepreneurial opportunities: A conceptual framework for entry into the industry Rapport nr: Master Thesis. 2006;91:2007

[20] Rerkrujipimol J, Assenov I. Medical tourism in Thailand and its marketing strategiesLast accessed on 2008 May 28 Available from: http://www.conference.phuket.psu.ac.th/PSU_OPEN_WEEK_2008/data/tourism/4_13.Pdf

[21] Sadr Momtaz N, Agharahimi Z. Medical tourism industry in Iran: Strategies for development Health Inf Manag. 2011;7(Special Issue 4):524–30

[22] Neha Malhotra and Kartik Dave Dimensions and drivers of medical tourism industry: a systematic review of qualitative evidence Published Online:January 12, 2024pp 60-82https://doi.org/10.1504/IJBG.2024.135998

[23] What is known about the effects of medical tourism in destination and departure countries? A scoping review International Journal for Equity. Volume 9, article number 24, (2010)

★★★